

## SOUTH AUSTRALIAN HERITAGE COUNCIL

### MINUTES

The 84<sup>th</sup> Meeting of the South Australian Heritage Council (the Council) was held on Wednesday 21 February 2018 in the Conference Room, Level 7, 81-95 Waymouth Street.

#### *Statement of Acknowledgement*

*We acknowledge this land that we meet on today is the traditional lands for Kaurna people and that we respect their spiritual relationship with their country. We also acknowledge the Kaurna people as the custodians of the Adelaide region and that their cultural and heritage beliefs are still as important to the living Kaurna people today.*

### PRESENT

**South Australian Heritage Council:** Chair: Mrs Judith Carr; Members, Ms Deborah Lindsay, Mr George Hobbs, Mr Gavin Leydon, Mr Jason Schulz, Mrs Carolyn Wigg; Professor Alison Mackinnon. Ms Sara Beazley and Ms Ali Ben Kahn.

Apologies: Nil.

**Secretariat:** Mr David Hanna, Executive Officer, Heritage South Australia, Department of Environment, Water and Natural Resources (DEWNR) and Ms Beverley Voigt, Manager Heritage South Australia, DEWNR.

**Guests:** Hon Ian Hunter MLC, Minister for Sustainability, Environment and Conservation (morning tea only); Mr John Hunt, Raptis and Sons Pty Ltd; Dr Louise Bird, Assessment Officer, Heritage South Australia, DEWNR; and Mr Matt Johnson, Executive Director, Economic and Sustainable Development, DEWNR.

### 1. WELCOME AND APOLOGIES

The Chair welcomed all present.

### 2. ADOPTION OF AGENDA AND DECLARATION OF CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

The agenda was adopted with no addition.

### 3. CONFIRMATION OF PREVIOUS MEETING MINUTES

The minutes of the 6 December 2017 meeting of the Council were confirmed subject to one amendment:

- Delete second paragraph under Item 7.2 on page 9.

**RESOLUTION:**

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Approved** the minutes of 6 December 2017 meeting subject to the amendment above.

**4. ACTION ITEMS**

The Chair noted that all actions had been completed except for one in relation to a review of the Heritage Places Act 1993 that will be progressed by the incoming Council.

**RESOLUTION:**

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Noted** progress of the action items.

**5. ITEMS FOR CONFIRMATION IN THE REGISTER****5.1 NORMANVILLE POLICE STATION**

Ms Voigt provided an overview and noted there were no written submissions received during the consultation period.

**RESOLUTION:**

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Resolved** to confirm the entry of the Normanville Police Station at 52-54 Main Road, Normanville in the South Australian Heritage Register as a State Heritage Place, pursuant to sections 18 (4) & 18 (5) of the *Heritage Places Act 1993* as it satisfies criteria (a) under section 16 (1) of the Act.
- **Approved** the Summary of State Heritage Place for Normanville Police Station at 52-54 Main Road, Normanville.

**5.2 No. 2 DOCK, PORT ADELAIDE**

Dr Bird was welcomed to the meeting. Dr Bird provided the Council with a summary of the three written submissions received during the public consultation period.

It was noted the submission from the History Trust of South Australia and the submission from Clair Shuttleworth of the Port Adelaide Branch of the National Trust of South Australia supported the listing. In their submissions they both agreed the No. 2 Dock meets criteria (a) and (b) under section 16 of the *Heritage Places Act 1993*.

It was noted that neither the History Trust of South Australia or Clair Shuttleworth requested to provide an oral representation in relation to their written submission.

The submission against the listing was provided by Jim Raptis of Raptis and Sons Pty Ltd. Mr John Hunt, representing the interests of Mr Raptis was welcomed to the meeting to provide an oral representation.

Mr Hunt made the following remarks on behalf of Mr Raptis:

- That sheds 13 and 14 should not be listed as they do not meet criteria (a) and (b) under section 16 (1) of the *Heritage Places Act 1993* (the Act) and that they are being considered for character not legislative reasons.
- From a technical point of view it is hard support the rationale for listing sheds 13 and 14 built in 1958 given they are in such a dilapidated condition and are full of asbestos.
- Mr Raptis agrees that the cranes do have some historical significance and they are not argued against.
- Mr Raptis has less interest in sheds 16 and 17 and they are probably more heritage significant.
- Mr Raptis believes sheds 13 and 14 should be developed as part of a maritime precinct. If these sheds were replaced in similar form with new sheds it would protect the character of the area.
- Raptis and Sons Pty Ltd leases a portion of the dock on wharf frontage.

The Chair thanked Mr Hunt for his presentation.

It was noted that No. 2 Dock has been entered on the South Australian Heritage Register in relation to demonstrating important aspects of the evolution or pattern of the State's history and that it has rare, uncommon or endangered qualities that are of cultural significance. This relates to criteria (a) and (b). It is not listed for its construction techniques or design characteristics (criterion (e)).

In discussing sheds 13 and 14, it was noted that they have a physical relationship with the surviving 1958 luffing cranes.

Council considered the argument provided by Mr Hunt and determined that the original reasons for provisionally listing No. 2 Dock under criteria (a) and (b) still applied.

In considering the written submission of Ms Clair Shuttleworth, Council considered the argument for No. 2 Dock also meeting criteria (c), (d), (f) and (g). Council agreed that there was not sufficient basis to revisit these criteria to form part of the listing.

It was noted the state heritage boundary does not align with the land titles, however this is not inconsistent with many state heritage listings.

#### **RESOLUTION:**

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Resolved** to confirm the entry of No. 2 Dock, Ocean Steamers Road, Port Adelaide in the South Australian Heritage Register as a State Heritage Place, pursuant to section 18 (4) &

18 (5) of the *Heritage Places Act 1993* as it satisfies criteria (a) and (b) under section 16 (1) of the Act.

- **Confirmed** the Summary of State Heritage Place for No. 2 Dock, Ocean Steamers Road, Port Adelaide.

### 5.3 OLD BULK STORE, ISLINGTON RAILWAY WORKSHOP

It was noted that Council considered public submissions at its meeting held on 6 December 2017 including three written submissions and two verbal representations. Council did not make a decision at that meeting as the Minister for Sustainability, Environment and Conservation (the Minister) had directed it not to make a decision under section 18(6) of the *Heritage Places Act 1993* while he considered a request to remove the Old Bulk Store in the public interest.

Following the 6 December 2017 meeting, Council wrote to the Minister regarding its consideration of the written submissions. The Council received a letter from the Minister advising that he determined not to direct the removal of the Old Bulk Store from the Heritage Register. This decision was made on the understanding the Council would modify the extent of listing for the Old Bulk Store to include only the external fabric of the building.

On page 6 of the Summary of State Heritage Place, the Council agreed to amend the extent of listing to 'external form and fabric of the building'.

On page 6 of the Summary of the State Heritage Place, the Council agreed to amend the components excluded from listing to 'Non-original fabric'.

#### RESOLUTION:

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Resolved** to confirm the entry of the Old Bulk Store, Islington Railway Workshops, Churchill Road, Kilburn in the South Australian Heritage Register as a State Heritage Place, pursuant to section 18 (4) & 18 (5) of the *Heritage Places Act 1993* as it satisfies criteria (a) and (e) under section 16 (1) of the Act.
- **Approved** the Summary of State Heritage Place, as amended, for the Old Bulk Store, Islington Railway Workshops, Churchill Road, Kilburn.

## 6. ITEM DIRECTED FOR REMOVAL FROM THE REGISTER

### 6.1 TRAVERSERS 1 & 2, ISLINGTON RAILWAY WORKSHOP

Council noted the direction of the Minister through his letter dated 13 January 2018 to remove Traversers 1 & 2 from the Heritage Register.

#### RESOLUTION:

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Removed** Traversers 1 & 2, Islington Railway Workshops, Churchill Road, Kilburn from the South Australian Heritage Register as directed by the Minister by instrument in writing in accordance with section 18 (7) of the *Heritage Places Act 1993*.

## 7 IN CAMERA DISCUSSION

The Council had a short in camera discussion.

## 8 ITEMS FOR DECISION / DISCUSSION

### 8.1 MINUTES OF ORDER – ERD COURT ST PETERS BIG QUAD

It was noted that during the Environment Resources and Development Court (ERD Court) conciliation conferences, St Peter's College had sought additional clarity regarding the exact boundary of the significant place, and exclusions from the extent of listing.

At its December 2017 meeting the Council approved the addition of a detailed site plan, including associated descriptive wording to the Summary of State Heritage Place for St Peter's College (Big Quad Precinct).

The final conciliation meeting at the ERD Court was held on 13 February 2018 at which the Minutes of Order were signed by both parties and provided to the Commissioner.

This concluded the appeal process to the satisfaction of both parties.

#### RESOLUTION:

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Noted** the changes that have been made to the Summary of State Heritage Place for St. Peter's College Big Quad Precinct (SHP 26457).
- **Noted** the ERD Court proceedings in relation to the St. Peter's College Big Quad Precinct (SHP 26457) had settled.

### 8.2 FITZGERALD BAY – AMENDMENT TO SUMMARY OF STATE HERITAGE PLACE

Dr Bird noted that new scientific information had emerged in relation to the listing of the Fitzgerald Bay Stranded Shingle Ridge. Mr Ian Lewis, the author of the assessment report, contacted Heritage South Australia to advise that recent research dated the Stranded Shingle Ridge to the Holocene period rather than the earlier Pleistocene epoch.

Council was provided with a revised Summary of State Heritage Place showing amendments in tracked changes.

Council requested that the dates on page eight in the Historical Timeline be aligned with the summary of the event.

Council requested a note be placed in the footer to indicate that the Summary of State Heritage Place had been amended on 21 February 2018.

Subject to the above, Council endorsed the amendments to the Summary of State Heritage Place.

**RESOLUTION:**

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Endorsed** the amendments to the Summary of State Heritage Place for Fitzgerald Bay Stranded Shingle Ridge near Whyalla CR/5800/763 A112 D53874 Hundreds of Cultana and Jenkins, CR/5867/224 A124 D55504 Hundred of Cultana, pursuant to section 21 of the *Heritage Places Act 1993* subject to the above amendments.

**8.3 FOR REVIEW – POLICY: HERITAGE AGREEMENTS**

Council agreed that the Policy was not required given that its content repeats what is in the Act and does not add any additional guidance to Council or staff.

**RESOLUTION:**

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Agreed** that the Policy: Heritage Agreements is no longer required and can be deleted.

**8.4 FOR REVIEW – PROCEDURE: HERITAGE AGREEMENTS**

Council reminded DEWNR of the requirement for Council to be notified prior to drafting a Heritage Agreement with an owner.

It was noted the word ‘notification’ was incorrectly spelt and requires correction. Council agreed that the Procedure was accurate.

**RESOLUTION:**

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Agreed** to the content of the Procedure: Heritage Agreement, subject to the minor amendment described above.

**8.5 FORT LARGS HERITAGE AGREEMENT**

It was noted that this item would not be discussed given that the draft Heritage Agreement was not available for Council’s review. It was noted that it would likely be provided to Council’s April 2018 meeting.

**8.6 STATEMENT OF KEY ISSUES FOR HERITAGE**

It was noted that given this is the last meeting of this membership group of the Council, it is considered appropriate that the Council provides a 'Statement of Key Heritage Issues' paper to the incoming Council with a copy to the Minister. The focus of the paper is on four issues:

1. Incentives for heritage owners (including funding for conservation works)
2. Economic and Public value of heritage
3. The South Australian Heritage Register,
4. Legislative reform.

#### **RESOLUTION:**

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Provided** comment on the Statement of Key Issues for Heritage paper; and
- **Noted** that following amendment, the paper will be provided to the incoming Council and a copy provided to the Minister.

#### **8.7 BELL'S PLUMBERS SHOP**

The Chair introduced this item and noted that the previous owner, Mr Philip March wrote to the Council on 7 April 2016 requesting it to consider removing the Bell's Plumbers Shop from entry in the South Australian Heritage Register (the Register) as a State Heritage Place.

Council had previously determined not to consider this request while the matter was before the ERD Court. Now that the legal proceedings had been finalised, Council agreed to consider whether the Bell's Plumbers Shop entry remained justified.

It was noted that Council members had undertaken a site visit to the place on 4 December 2017.

Council noted the recommendation of Heritage South Australia that the place retains its heritage significance and ought to remain on the Register.

Council noted that the focus of its deliberations were solely about whether the place still demonstrates, through its physical form, the heritage significance that resulted in it being entered in the Register in November 1985. Ongoing management concerns were not taken into consideration.

It was noted that Bell's Plumbers Shop reinforces the identity of the corner, which is dominated by the Bon Marche Building and contributes to the character of the district.

Following a discussion about the historical, architectural and environmental reasons the place was listed, the Council agreed that there was sufficient justification for the place to remain on the Register.

Action: DEWNR to prepare a draft letter of reply to Mr Philip March for the Chair's consideration and signature.

#### **RESOLUTION:**

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Determined** that the entry of Bell's Plumbers Ship, 15 Payneham Road, College Park, remains justified (section 23(1) of the *Heritage Places Act 1993*), and that the place remains on the South Australian Heritage Register.

## 9 ITEMS FOR NOTING

### 9.1 DEWNR REPORT

Ms Voigt noted the following matters raised through the DEWNR Report to Council members:

- Mr Rick Bullers has been appointed to Heritage South Australia as the new Senior Maritime Heritage Officer following Amer Khan's departure to Queensland;
- Ms Deborah Morgan has recently been elected as the new President of the National Trust of South Australia;
- throughout the month of February, the winning entries from the Sea Pixels photo competition along with a selection of entries from the Australasian Institute for Maritime Archaeology (AIMA) have been on display in the Adelaide Convention Centre. Almost 10,000 people have reportedly walked past the display during the month which has been a fantastic promotion for maritime heritage;
- Heritage South Australia hosted an Archaeological Policy Workshop on 14 February with the aim of developing some more detailed policy/procedures in relation to the issuing of archaeological permits;
- the National Trust of Australia are convening a National Heritage Tourism Summit in Burra on the 26 -27 April 2018;
- the History Trust of South Australia will be holding an Open Doors: Built Heritage Weekend on Saturday 28 & Sunday 29 April;
- the State Government has recently transferred 19 properties to the National Trust of South Australia; and
- noted the performance of the Western Australia Heritage Revolving Fund.

### RESOLUTION:

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Noted** the DEWNR Report.

### 9.2 REPORTS ON DECISIONS MADE UNDER DELEGATION

Report by the Register Clerk: Council queried the high number of errors provided by the City of Onkaparinga in relation to State Heritage Places within its jurisdiction. Most of the minor errors related to changes to street address.

Action: Check with Register Clerk why so many errors provided at one time.

### RESOLUTION:



The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Noted** the reports on the exercise of Council's delegations.

### 9.3 CORRESPONDENCE

Correspondence was noted.

#### RESOLUTION:

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Noted** the correspondence received and sent since its last meeting.

### CLOSE OF MEETING

The Chair closed the meeting at 12:30pm and thanked the retiring members for their service to the Council – Carolyn Wigg, Gavin Leydon, Sara Beazley and George Hobbs.

The members thanked Chair Judith Carr for her excellent contribution to the Council over the last nine years.



**Mrs Judith Carr**

**Date:** 14 March 2018

**Chair**