

SOUTH AUSTRALIAN HERITAGE COUNCIL

MINUTES

The 81st Meeting of the South Australian Heritage Council (the Council) was held on Wednesday 30 August 2017 in the Conference Room, Level 7, 81-95 Waymouth Street.

Statement of Acknowledgement

We acknowledge this land that we meet on today is the traditional lands for Kurna people and that we respect their spiritual relationship with their country. We also acknowledge the Kurna people as the custodians of the Adelaide region and that their cultural and heritage beliefs are still as important to the living Kurna people today.

PRESENT

South Australian Heritage Council: Chair: Mrs Judith Carr; Members: Ms Sara Beazley, Ms Deborah Lindsay, Mr George Hobbs, Mr Rob Donaldson (by teleconference) Mrs Carolyn Wigg and Professor Alison Mackinnon.

Apologies: Mr Gavin Leydon and Mr Jason Schulz.

Secretariat: Mr David Hanna, Executive Officer, State Heritage Unit, Department of Environment, Water and Natural Resources (DEWNR) and Ms Beverley Voigt, Manager Heritage and Major Reform, State Heritage Unit, DEWNR.

Guests: Dr Louise Bird, Assessment Officer, State Heritage Unit, DEWNR; and Ms Kirsty Nield, Assessment Officer, State Heritage Unit, DEWNR.

1. WELCOME AND APOLOGIES

The Chair welcomed all present.

2. ADOPTION OF AGENDA AND DECLARATION OF CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

The agenda was adopted without any additions.

During the meeting, Ms Lindsay declared a conflict of interest in relation to the consideration of Item 8.1 on the Adelaide Showground given that her firm, DASH Architects has been engaged by the Royal Agricultural and Horticultural Society South Australia.

3. CONFIRMATION OF PREVIOUS MEETING MINUTES

The minutes of the 5 July 2017 meeting of the Council were confirmed without change.

RESOLUTION:

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Approved** the minutes of 5 July 2017 meeting.

4. ACTION ITEMS

Council noted the update on progress against the actions in the action list.

RESOLUTION:

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Noted** progress of the action items.

5. SA HERITAGE COUNCIL IN-CAMERA DISCUSSION

Council members held a short in-camera discussion on strategic and administrative matters.

6. PROVISIONAL ENTRY IN THE REGISTER**6.1 Former Normanville Police Station, 52-54 Main Road, Normanville**

Ms Kirsty Nield, DEWNR, provided an overview of the assessment.

DEWNR recommend that the Former Normanville Police Station and Government Complex be entered in the register under criterion (a) it demonstrates important aspects of the evolution or pattern of the State's history.

It was noted that the former Police Station is one of the oldest surviving police buildings in the State. The first section was constructed in 1855, with the two-storey post and telegraph office being built in 1863. It demonstrates aspects of the evolution of the Fleurieu Peninsula during the mid-1850s. It was a multi-use building but not initially built for multipurpose function. This evolved with time. Along with the police function, the building served as a post and telegraph office, customs house, registry office and a centre for sea rescue.

It was noted that the interior of the building had not been assessed, however the external building fabric and stables remain substantially intact, illustrating several aspects of the place's long-term function and use.

Council discussed the assessment report and considered the nomination against each of the criteria. Council agreed to list against criterion (a).

Council agreed that the name of the place should be 'Former Normanville Police Station'. This needs to be updated throughout the Summary of State Heritage Place.

Noted that reference to the 'South Australian Police Force' should be amended to 'South Australia Police Force'.

In the first line of page 2 of the Summary of State Heritage Place the word 'were' should be deleted after the word 'stations'.

In the last paragraph on page 2, the first word of the first sentence being 'thus' should be deleted.

In the Site Plan, the Council requested that the boundary of State Heritage Place be represented by a yellow line only, depicting the land parcel and that the red lines around the structures of the police building and stable be removed. The legend needs to be updated to reflect this.

RESOLUTION:

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Provisionally entered** the Former Normanville Police Station, 52–54 Main Road, Normanville, 5204 in the South Australian Heritage Register as a State Heritage Place, as it meets criterion (a) under Section 16 of the *Heritage Places Act 1993*.
- **Approved** the 'Summary of State Heritage Place' for the Former Normanville Police Station subject to the amendments noted above.

6.2 Former Primitive Methodist Chapel, Corner of Stirling and Chapel Streets, Milang.

Ms Kirsty Nield provided an overview of the assessment of this place. The heritage assessment recommendation report found that the Milang Chapel is a typical example of a rural Primitive Methodist Church that is associated with the establishment of Primitive Methodism in South Australia and more specifically in the Milang area.

In addition to its connection with Primitive Methodism, the Milang Chapel was owned by the Manchester Unity Independent Order of Oddfellows. While the Milang Chapel may have been used by the Oddfellows for meetings, the relationship between the Milang Chapel and the Oddfellows was primarily a financial arrangement.

The Council noted that an analysis (including images) of other similar chapels was useful in the decision making process.

Council considered the nomination and the assessment report. Council considered the nomination against each criterion and determined that the nominated place does not fulfil any of the criteria under Section 16 of the *Heritage Places Act 1993*. The Council determined to reject the nomination.

It was noted that two other churches in Milang were recommended for State listing in the Heritage Survey of the Murray Riverland in 1984 and neither are local or State listed. These are the Church of Christ, c1857, Watson & Cox Street; and Former Congregational Church, c1862), Orana and McDonald Street.

RESOLUTION:

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Rejected** the nomination of the former Primitive Methodist Chapel, 3 Chapel Street, Milang for entry in the South Australian Heritage Register as a State Heritage Place, as it does not

meet any of the criteria for State heritage significance under section 16 of the *Heritage Places Act 1993*.

6.3 Sealer's Hut, 76 Bates Road, Emu Bay, Kangaroo Island

Dr Louise Bird provided an overview of the assessment of the Whittle Farmhouse (reputed Sealer's Hut), Emu Bay, Kangaroo Island. The 'Sealers' Hut' was nominated by the owner.

Dr Bird noted that the 1991 Heritage Survey undertaken by Heritage Investigations (Marsden et al) and Historical Consultants Pty Ltd (Linn, et al) did not identify Sealers' Hut as either a State Heritage or Local Heritage Place.

DEWNR recommended rejection of the nomination as it did not meet any of the criteria under section 16 of the *Heritage Places Act 1993*.

The Council considered the nomination and assessment against the criteria under section 16 of the Heritage Places Act and agreed to reject the nomination.

RESOLUTION:

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Rejected** the nomination of Whittle Farmhouse (Reputed Sealer's Hut), 76 Bates Road, Emu Bay, Kangaroo Island SA 5223 for entry in the South Australian Heritage Register as a State Heritage Place, as it does not meet any of the criteria for State heritage listing under Section 16 of the *Heritage Places Act 1993*.

6.4 Wharf Sheds at No. 2 Dock, Ocean Steamers Road, Port Adelaide

Ms Beverley Voigt provided an overview of the assessment of Wharf Sheds at No. 2 Dock. It was noted that the assessment was undertaken by Swanbury Penglase Architects.

It was noted that No. 2 Dock is a rare surviving example of wharf operations from the Inter-War and Post-War period. The site is comprised of wharfs, wharf aprons, transit sheds, loading cranes and rail lines associated with shipping operations at Port Adelaide from the 1920s until the 1970s.

The assessment report recommended that the nomination meets criterion a) and b). Council agreed that criterion a) and b) were met.

There was discussion around criterion g) and whether this met the threshold, particularly in regards to the association with the Marine and Harbors Board and also the deadly 1924 *City of Singapore* vessel explosion. Council determined that it did not meet the threshold for criterion g).

Council considered the Summary of State Heritage Place and made the following amendments:

- determined that the name of the place should be 'No. 2 Dock' (remove 'and associated structures');
- in the fourth line of the second paragraph of Statement of Heritage Significance, insert the word 'luffing' in front of the word 'cranes'.

- In the fourth line of the second paragraph of Statement of Heritage Significance, insert the words 'No. 13 and No. 14' to the description of the sheds.

RESOLUTION:

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Provisionally entered** No. 2 Dock in the South Australian Heritage Register as a State Heritage Place, as it meets criteria (a) and (b) under Section 16 of the *Heritage Places Act 1993*.
- **Approved** the proposed 'Summary of State Heritage Place' for No. 2 Dock subject to the amendments described above.

7 CONFIRMATION IN THE REGISTER

7.1 North Adelaide Service Reservoir, Corner of O'Connell Street and Barton Terrace, North Adelaide

It was noted that the Council provisionally entered the North Adelaide Service Reservoir at its meeting on 7 December 2016.

Dr Louise Bird advised that six written representations were received by DEWNR during the consultation period. Five submissions are clearly in support of registration. It was not entirely clear whether the sixth submission was in support or not. DEWNR attempted to contact the author seeking clarification however the author did not reply.

Council considered the representations received. Some submissions proposed that the place had heritage significance in relation to criterion (b) under Section 16 of the *Heritage Places Act 1993*, however Council resolved to maintain its previous view that this criterion was not met. It was noted that one submission proposed an association between David Gall and the North Adelaide Service Reservoir because of Gall's opposition to its construction and other subsequent examples of alienation of the Park Lands. Dr Bird researched the significance of Mr Gall and determined that he was locally significant but was not a state significant person.

Council resolved to confirm the entry in the South Australian Heritage Register as it satisfies criteria (a) and (e) under Section 16 of the *Heritage Places Act 1993 Act*. It further resolved to make the following changes to the Summary of State Heritage Place:

- Remove the lines on the site plan that denote components of high significance.
- In the legend of the site plan, the yellow line should be labelled as 'Boundary of State Heritage Place'
- In 'History of the Place' on page five, add a sentence at the end of the page that states 'At the time there was some controversy about the location of the reservoir.'

RESOLUTION:

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Confirms** the entry of North Adelaide Service Reservoir, Corner of O'Connell Street and Barton Terrace, North Adelaide in the South Australian Heritage Register as a State Heritage Place, pursuant to sections 18(4) & 18(5) of the *Heritage Places Act 1993* as it satisfies criteria (a) and (e) under section 16(1) of the Act:
 - (a) it demonstrates important aspects of the evolution or pattern of the State's history
 - (e) it demonstrates a high degree of creative, aesthetic or technical accomplishment or is an outstanding representative of particular construction techniques or design characteristics
- **Approves** the Summary of State Heritage Place subject to the amendments described above.

8 ITEMS FOR DECISION / DISCUSSION**8.1 HERITAGE LISTING OF THE ADELAIDE SHOWGROUND**

Ms Lindsay departed the room for this item noting her declared conflict of interest.

The nomination of the Adelaide Showground arose out of the *Twentieth Century Heritage Survey – Stage 2 (1928-45)* which was part of the former Department of Environment and Heritage thematic survey program conducted in 2008. The survey recommended that the Elders Pavilion, the Old Ram Shed, the Stud Sheep Pavilion, the Secretary's Office and the Ridley Memorial Gates with associated fencing be entered in the South Australian Heritage Register.

The Chair noted that in the past Council has adopted different approaches to the listing of large sites with multiple structures such as the Adelaide Showground. At Lobethal Woollen Mill, the site as a whole was listed and individual buildings were assessed and ranked for their heritage significance. At the Islington Railyards individual buildings/structures within the site have been assessed. For the Adelaide Park Lands and City Squares the Council is assessing the whole of the site as a cultural landscape and are not assessing individual buildings/structures.

DEWNR provided a paper outlining possible approaches to the heritage assessment of the Adelaide Showground. Council discussed the merits of each suggested approach and requested DEWNR to progress with the individual assessment of the five buildings/structures nominated in the 2008 Survey.

RESOLUTION:

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Requested** DEWNR to assess each of the five buildings / structures recommended through the *Twentieth Century Heritage Survey – Stage 2 (1928-45)* as individual assessments.

8.2 FORMER BELL'S PLUMBER'S SHOP

Council agreed that it would discuss this matter in-camera.

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

RESOLUTION:

The South Australian Heritage Council:

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

8.3 SA HERITAGE COUNCIL ANNUAL REPORT 2016-17

The Council considered a draft annual report for 2016-17. It was noted that the requirements for the report have narrowed and therefore the report does not contain information on individual listings as in previous years.

The annual report has been prepared using the template provided by the Department of Premier and Cabinet.

Council endorsed the Annual Report for 2016-17 and agreed that the Chair will sign it and DEWNR will arrange for it to be provided to the Minister for Sustainability, Environment and Conservation.

RESOLUTION:

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Endorsed** the Annual Report 2016-17.

- **Noted** that it will be signed by the Chair and that DEWNR will arrange for it to be submitted to the Minister for Sustainability, Environment and Conservation.

8.4 PROCEDURE: ACCOUNTABILITY – FOR REVIEW

The Council reviewed minor amendments to its Procedure: Accountability and approved the amendments.

RESOLUTION:

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Approved** the amendments to the Procedure: Accountability.
- **Noted** that when approved and signed by the Chair, DEWNR will arrange for it to be placed on the Council's website.

8.5 PROCEDURE: COMMUNICATIONS – FOR REVIEW

The Council reviewed minor amendments to Procedure: Communications. It was noted DEWNR suggested that reference to committees established by Council be removed from the procedure. Council resolved that reference to committees of the Council should remain in the procedure given that the Council may create committees in the future.

Council also requested that under 1.5, first dot point, delete the words 'public and'.

Under section 2. Webpage, the dot point relating to heritage assessment reports ought to be amended to 'heritage assessment recommendation reports' and note that these reports are only to be placed on the web page after the meeting of the Heritage Council at which they are tabled.

RESOLUTION:

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Approved** the amendments to the Procedure: Communications subject to the amendments discussed above.

8.6 GUIDELINE: SUMMARY OF STATE HERITAGE PLACE – FOR REVIEW

The Council reviewed minor amendments to the Guideline: Summary of State Heritage Place. Council requested that the words 'architects and planners' be removed from the third dot point under the heading 'Objective'.

Council requested that the approved pro forma of the Summary of State Heritage Place be attached to the Guideline.

RESOLUTION:

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Approved** the amendments to the Guideline: Summary of State Heritage Place subject to the discussion above.

9 ITEMS FOR NOTING

9.1 UPDATE FROM CHAIR OF HERITAGE COUNCIL

The Chair noted that she met with two advisers from the Minister's office to discuss heritage priorities for this coming year.

9.2 STATUS OF ASSESSMENTS

DEWNR provided the Council with information as to the status of nominations under assessment, corrections, provisional entries, confirmations and rejections / removals.

It was noted there are currently twenty-two nominations awaiting assessment.

Four public nominations have been received since the last report to Council in May 2017.

RESOLUTION:

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Noted** the status of assessments.

9.3 ADELAIDE PARK LANDS – YOURSAY CONSULTATION UPDATE

It was noted that DEWNR established a YourSAy on-line survey consisting of four questions. As at 22 August 2017 there had been over 1470 responses to the YourSAy on-line survey. The survey will remain open until the end of September 2017.

97% of the respondents to the survey reported that the Adelaide Park Lands and City Squares are of heritage significance to them, with 94% of the respondents considering that they will be of value to them in the future.

RESOLUTION:

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Noted** the interim results of the YourSAy on-line survey for the Adelaide Park Lands and City Squares.

9.4 REPORTS ON DECISIONS MADE UNDER DELEGATION

Council noted the report provided in relation to the exercise of Council's delegations.

RESOLUTION:

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Noted** the reports on the exercise of Council's delegations by the Chair and the Manager, Stat Heritage Unit, DEWNR.

10 ANY OTHER BUSINESS

Nil.

CLOSE OF MEETING

The Chair thanked all in attendance and closed the meeting at 12:25pm.

A photograph of a handwritten signature in blue ink on a white piece of paper. The signature reads "Judith Carr".

Mrs Judith Carr

Date: 19 October 2017

Chair