

## SOUTH AUSTRALIAN HERITAGE COUNCIL

### MINUTES

The 109<sup>th</sup> Meeting of the South Australian Heritage Council (the Council) was held on Thursday 16 July 2020 via Electronic Means. (This meeting was held via video conference due to the isolation requirements of the COVID-19 pandemic).

#### Statement of Acknowledgement

*The Chairperson acknowledged that this land that the majority of Council members meet on today is the traditional lands for Kaurna people and that the Council respect their spiritual relationship with their country. The Chairperson also acknowledged the Kaurna people as the custodians of the Adelaide region and that their cultural and heritage beliefs are still as important to the living Kaurna people today. Ms Jan Ferguson noted she was participating in the video meeting via Beltana and acknowledged the Adnyamathanha people – the traditional owners of Beltana region and paid respect to their spiritual relationship with that country. Mr David Stevenson noted he was participating in the video meeting via Burra and acknowledged the Ngadjuri people – the traditional owners of the Burra region and paid respect to their spiritual relationship with that country. Emeritus Professor Allison Mackinnon AM noted she was participating in the video meeting via Port Elliot and acknowledged the Ngarrindjeri people – the traditional owners of that region and paid respect to their spiritual relationship with that country.*

### PRESENT

**South Australian Heritage Council:** Chair: Mr Keith Conlon OAM Members: Emeritus Professor Alison Mackinnon AM, Mr Marcus Rolfe, Ms Kate McDougall, Mr Jason Schulz, Ms Robyn Taylor, Mr Michael Constantine, Mr David Stevenson and Ms Jan Ferguson OAM.

Apologies: Nil

**Secretariat:** Mr David Hanna, Executive Officer, Heritage South Australia, Department for Environment and Water (DEW) and Ms Bev Voigt, Manager Heritage South Australia.

### 1. WELCOME AND APOLOGIES

Mr Conlon welcomed all to the 109<sup>th</sup> meeting of the South Australian Heritage Council (the Council).

Ms Cate Hart, Executive Director, Environment, Heritage and Sustainability, and Ms Merridie Martin, Director Heritage and Native Vegetation were welcomed as observers.

Nil Apologies.

## 2. ADOPTION OF AGENDA AND DECLARATION OF CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

### Agenda

The agenda was adopted with the addition of an item under 'Any Other Business', being 'truth telling in relation to State Heritage listed monuments and statues'.

### Declarations of conflict of interest

It was noted that Council agreed that Ms McDougall does not have a conflict in relation to Item 6.3 – Glenthorne National Park, but wanted it on record that a section of a 2004 report, of which she was the author when Heritage Advisor to the University, titled 'Heritage Listed Buildings Inventory – Report to University of Adelaide' was included as an appendix to the nomination. This report did not make any reference to or recommendations for the creation of a State Heritage Area on the then Glenthorne campus, and Ms McDougall was not consulted in relation to the nomination.

## 3 PREVIOUS MEETING MINUTES

Council considered the minutes of the 11 June 2020 meeting and approved them without amendment.

### **RESOLUTION:**

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Approved** the minutes of the 11 June 2020 meeting.

## 4. ACTION ITEMS

Council noted the status of the action items.

### **RESOLUTION:**

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Noted** the status of the action list.

## 5. IN CAMERA DISCUSSION

Council agreed that there was no requirement for any in camera discussion at this meeting.

## 6. FOR DECISION / DISCUSSION

### 6.1 Council's Communication document 2019/20

A draft communications document that tells the story of the Council's work for 2019-20 has been prepared and was provided for Council's consideration and approval.

Mr Conlon thanked Mr Hanna for his work preparing this document.

## RESOLUTIONS:

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Considered** and **approved** the 2019-20 South Australian Heritage Council Communications document.
- **Approved** provision of the final communications document to the Minister for Environment and Water, CE of DEW and other key stakeholders as an attachment to its Communique, following the meeting.
- **Noted** the document will be published on the Council's web page.

### 6.2 Guidelines for Interpreting Heritage Criteria

It was noted that the draft guidelines are primarily based on a mixture of the intent of the original South Australian guidelines and the very detailed and useful document developed by Victoria in 2019. The sub-committee agreed that the Victoria example was the best available guidelines document, and so a significant portion of the draft SA guidelines has been borrowed from that. This can be done under the information-sharing agreement between the Heritage Chairs and Officials of Australia and New Zealand.

South Australia's Guidelines for Interpreting the State Heritage Criteria were last updated in 2015. Since that time, the guidelines have helped inform all heritage assessments undertaken for the Council. However, there have been some issues and anomalies that have caused concern when interpreting the guidelines, such as lack of clarity about whether all tests had to be met or only some tests (AND vs OR).

Mr Stevenson noted that he had tested the document with the Burra Council planning department and they thought it provided clear guidelines and was exceptionally well worded.

Mr Rolfe indicated the images helped with the interpretation of the written text.

Council members on the working group discussed the process of refining the document, and the importance of testing the document through assessment.

Council tested elements of the document with a variety of different places including the St Maximilian Church at Ottoway, the Fishermans Market, Shed 26 at New Port and the Salisbury Civic Centre.

It was suggested that the threshold between State and Local Heritage items could be fleshed out in the document – including some examples.

Council noted that it is important to get the balance right between adequate information, but not overwhelming, simple enough for anyone to digest, but also accurate and sharp. These are illustrative and meant to be so. Council do not want it to get over detailed as it might be off putting for people using them for nomination purposes.

The Guidelines are important but do not supplant the legislated criteria. Furthermore it was recognised that the Guidelines are not meant to be set in stone – they can be improved upon with more examples etc. as time goes by.

Council approved the proposed process for finalising the Guidelines as set out in the agenda paper.

Council thanked the working group members.

Action: Mr Rolfe noted he had one small amendment and he would email that directly to Mrs Anna Pope.

Action: It was agreed that Heritage SA could start testing the Guidelines and then report back to Council at a suitable time regarding how they are being received and how they are working.

## RESOLUTIONS:

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Noted** the draft guidelines for interpreting the State Heritage Criteria.
- **Approved** the the proposed process for reviewing, finalising and endorsing South Australia's updated 'Guidelines for Interpreting State Heritage Crieria' document, including the request for feedback by Friday 31 July.

### 6.3 Glenthorne National Park – State Heritage Area proposal

It was noted that the group comprising the former 'Lizard Lodge' Coachhouse, Smokehouse, Underground Tank and Cellar and Former Army Remount Depot Ammunition Magazines, former Glenthorne CSIRO Field Station, 2 Majors Road O'Halloran Hill was entered in the South Australian Heritage Register as a State Heritage Place on 25 July 2002, under criterion g - *it has a special association with the life or work of a person or organisation or an event of historical importance.*

Dr Pamela Smith, Flinders University, wrote to the Council on 12 November 2018, informing the Council that she had prepared a proposal to declare the 208 hectare Glenthorne property on the corner of Main South and Majors Road, O'Halloran Hill as a State Heritage Area. It was noted that Glenthorne is already entered in the South Australian Heritage Register as a State Heritage Place and is well known for its historic connections to Major Thomas Shuldham O'Halloran, the Porter family, the Australian Army and CSIRO.

This State Heritage Area proposal was prepared on behalf of the Friends of Glenthorne and sent to the Hon David Speirs MP, Minister for Environment and Heritage, asking that he consider the proposal to protect Glenthorne as a significant heritage area within the Adelaide Metropolitan Area.

The Minister has written to the Chair of the Council requesting that the Council consider a nomination to list Glenthorne Farm as a State Heritage Area.

Council discussed the merits of the proposal including the significance of the paddocks around the heritage buildings that were home to horses involved in World War 1 effort.

Council considered the criteria for listing a State Heritage Area and determined that Glenthorne Farm did not meet this criteria.

Council mooted some future work regarding a review of the current Statement of Heritage Significance for the State Heritage Place listing with regard recognition of the role of the CSIRO on the site.

Action: Heritage SA to review current Statement of Heritage Significance in relation to the role of the CSIRO and provide to Council at a future meeting for endorsement.

Council rejected the nomination, but thanked Dr Pam Smith for bringing this matter to its attention.

### **RESOLUTION:**

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Noted** and discussed the contents of this paper and its attachments.
- **Rejected** the nomination of the Glenthorne property, corner of Main South and Majors Road, O'Halloran Hill (CR 6233/593) for designation as a State Heritage Area.
- **Endorsed** the Chair of the Council writing to the Minister for Environment and Water, informing him of the Council's decision.

## **7 ITEMS UNDER CONSIDERATION FOR CONFIRMATION IN THE SA HERITAGE REGISTER**

### **7.1 Edinburgh Castle Hotel, 233-239 Currie Street, Adelaide**

On 18 January 2019, a member of the public, nominated the Edinburgh Castle Hotel, 233 Currie Street, Adelaide for State Heritage listing. The nomination suggests that the Edinburgh Castle Hotel meets criteria (a), (c), (f) and (g) of section 16 of the *Heritage Places Act 1993* (the Act).

The nomination suggests that the hotel meets four of the seven section 16 criteria in the Act for listing as a State Heritage Place.

A review of the nomination and the assessment of the heritage values of the place suggests that the Edinburgh Castle Hotel does not meet any of the criteria for listing as a State Heritage Place.

The assessment was provided for the Council's consideration. Council noted there was no fabric on the interior that would contribute to a possible State Heritage listing, given the alterations that have been made over the years.

It was noted that this Hotel is not the oldest continuously licensed premises in South Australia.

### **RESOLUTION:**

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Rejected** the nomination of **EDINBURGH CASTLE HOTEL, 233 CURRIE STREET, ADELAIDE CT 5389/438 A2 F137709 HUNDRED of ADELAIDE** for entry in the South Australian Heritage Register as a State Heritage Place, as it does not meet any of the criteria for State heritage listing under section 16 of the *Heritage Places Act 1993*.

## 7.2 Cummins House, Novar Gardens – Objects

Dr Louise Bird noted that a single Assessment Report and Summary of State Heritage Objects has been prepared for the Morphett Family Furniture Collection to reduce duplication of information.

Cummins House is owned by the Minister for Environment and Water on behalf of the Government of South Australia. Of the 21 objects that form the Morphett Furniture Collection, 17 are owned by the Minister for Environment and Water, 2 by the Cummins Society, and 2 by Mrs Legoe, a member of the Morphett family.

Each object within the collection is dealt with separately within the report, with an individual 'Record of Heritage Object' sheet recording specific details such as name, object number, description, photo, location, owner details and statement of heritage significance. If listed, each State Heritage Object will have separate entry in the Register, and will be identified by individual SHO numbers.

Council members considered the recommendations and agreed to approve each and every one.

Council noted that the agenda paper brings to bear the issue of ownership of the objects and it was clarified that the Council is only legislatively responsible for listing and Heritage South Australia have the management issues well in hand.

It was noted that Council's motives around listing relate to the heritage values and not the ownership.

It was also noted that the location of the objects will be revised in the documentation, if required, when and if the objects are confirmed by the Council.

### **RESOLUTIONS:**

The South Australian Heritage Council:

**Provisionally entered** the following in the South Australian Heritage Register as a State Heritage Object deemed to be intrinsically related to the heritage significance of Cummins House (SHP 10552):

1. The Hallstand Cummins House Morphett Family Furniture Collection SHO 10552–001.
2. The Collard And Collard Grand Piano And Box Stool, Cummins House Morphett Family Furniture Collection SHO 10552–002.

3. the Pair Of Settees, Cummins House Morphett Family Furniture Collection SHO 10552–003 & SHO 10552–004.
4. Provisionally entered the Armchair, Cummins House Morphett Family Furniture Collection SHO 10552–005
5. Provisionally entered the Bergere, Cummins House Morphett Family Furniture Collection SHO 10552–006.
6. Provisionally entered the Circular Salon Couch, Cummins House Morphett Family Furniture Collection SHO 10552–007.
7. Provisionally entered the Drawing Room Curtains, Cummins House Morphett Family Furniture Collection Sho 10552–008.
8. Provisionally entered the Over Mantle Mirror, Cummins House Morphett Family Furniture Collection Sho 10552–009.
9. Provisionally entered the Side Table, Cummins House Morphett Family Furniture Collection SHO 10552–010.
10. Provisionally entered the Marianne Fisher Chair, Cummins House Morphett Family Furniture Collection SHO 10552–011.
11. Provisionally entered the Chair, Cummins House Morphett Family Furniture Collection SHO 10552–0012.
12. Provisionally entered the Shamrock Side Table, Cummins House Morphett Family Furniture Collection SHO 10552–013.
13. Provisionally entered the Chiffonier, Cummins House Morphett Family Furniture Collection SHO 10552–014.
14. Provisionally entered the Dining Table And Twelve Chairs, Cummins House Morphett Family Furniture Collection SHO 10552–015.
15. Provisionally entered the Dressing Table, Cummins House Morphett Family Furniture Collection SHO 10552–016.
16. Provisionally entered the Wardrobe, Cummins House Morphett Family Furniture Collection SHO 10552–017.
17. Provisionally entered the Washstand, Cummins House Morphett Family Furniture Collection SHO 10552–018.
18. Provisionally entered the Commode, Cummins House Morphett Family Furniture Collection SHO 10552–019.
19. Provisionally entered the Washstand, Cummins House Morphett Family Furniture Collection SHO 10552–020.
20. Provisionally entered the Mangle, Cummins House Morphett Family Furniture Collection SHO 10552–021.

**Approved the Summary of State Heritage Object for the following:**

- 1) Hallstand Cummins House Morphett Family Furniture collection SHO 10552–001.
- 2) Collard and Collard Grand Piano and box stool, Cummins House Morphett family furniture collection SHO 10552–002.

- 3) Pair of Settees Cummins House Morphett Family Furniture Collection SHO 10552–003 & SHO 10552–004.
- 4) Armchair, Cummins House Morphett Family Furniture Collection SHO 10552–005.
- 5) Bergere, Cummins House Morphett Family Furniture Collection SHO 10552–006.
- 6) Circular Salon Couch, Cummins House Morphett Family Furniture Collection SHO 10552 – 007.
- 7) Drawing room curtains, Cummins House Morphett Family Furniture Collection SHO 10552–008.
- 8) Over Mantle Mirror Cummins House Morphett Family Furniture Collection SHO 10552–009.
- 9) Side Table, Cummins House Morphett Family Furniture Collection SHO 10552–010
- 10) Marianne Fisher Chair, Cummins House Morphett Family Furniture Collection SHO 10552–011.
- 11) Chair, Cummins House Morphett Family Furniture Collection SHO 10552–0012.
- 12) Shamrock Side Table, Cummins House Morphett Family Furniture collection SHO 10552–013.
- 13) Chiffonier, Cummins House Morphett Family Furniture Collection SHO 10552–014.
- 14) Dining Table and twelve Chairs, Cummins House Morphett Family Furniture collection SHO 10552–015.
- 15) Dressing table, Cummins House Morphett Family Furniture Collection SHO 10552–016 .
- 16) Wardrobe, Cummins House Morphett Family Furniture Collection SHO 10552–017.
- 17) Washstand, Cummins House Morphett Family Furniture Collection SHO 10552–018.
- 18) Commode, Cummins House Morphett Family Furniture Collection SHO 10552–019.
- 19) Washstand, Cummins House Morphett Family Furniture Collection SHO 10552–020.
- 20) Mangle, Cummins House Morphett Family Furniture Collection SHO 10552–021.

### **7.3 Martindale Hall, via Mintaro – Objects**

It was noted that Martindale Hall is a significant nineteenth century property that was State heritage listed in 1980 and represents a 'grand baronial' lifestyle and was home to both the Bowman and Mortlock families. The property contains more than 1,000 potentially significant items including furniture, furnishings, specialised collections and many other possessions that are likely to be intrinsically related to the heritage significance of the property.

Due to the number of items at Martindale Hall, it is proposed that they be grouped into collections based on similar associations and intrinsic relationships to the State Heritage Place. These collections will be presented to the Council, over a number of meetings, for consideration for listing as State Heritage Objects.

The first collection provided to Council for its consideration at this meeting as a State Heritage Object is the Mortlock Weapons Collection.



The Mortlock Weapons Collection is comprised of 123 weapons, of which a number are comprised of multiple components, such as a blade and scabbard. Two weapons are missing, namely a naval ceremonial sword and an arrow from Papua. These have not been included in the proposed State Heritage Object 'Mortlock Weapons Collection'.

Council discussed items in the collection relating to First Nations. Heritage South Australia recognise the importance of attempting to identify the provenance of these and will work with the curators at the SA Museum in this regard. It was noted that it will be a substantial body of work to ascertain the provenance but it is very important as it helps to tell the full historical story of these items.

It was noted that each object will be listed on the Register entry.

Council agreed it is important to acknowledge, through its public communication, that in some cases these objects may have been taken from their owner and acknowledge the cultural connection of these objects to the appropriate First Nation people.

Council agreed to provisionally enter the Mortlock Weapons Collection in the South Australian Heritage Register.

## RESOLUTIONS:

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Noted** the proposed approach for listing Martindale Hall collections as State Heritage Objects.
- **Provisionally entered** the **MORTLOCK WEAPONS COLLECTION SHO 10067-001** in the South Australian Heritage Register as a State Heritage Object, as it is deemed to be intrinsically related to the heritage significance of Martindale Hall (SHP 10067).
- **Approved** the Summary of State Heritage Object for the **MORTLOCK WEAPONS COLLECTION SHO 10067-001**.

## 8 ITEMS FOR NOTING

### 8.1 Chairperson's Report

Mr Conlon indicated he had an excellent meeting with Ms Shona Reid, Executive Director, Reconciliation SA earlier in the week and that Mr Hanna had circulated notes about that meeting to Council members. Mr Conlon noted he had since spoken to Mr Toby Forde, Manager in Aboriginal Affairs, who will seek three nominations for the historical themes working party from the State Aboriginal Heritage Committee at its 30 July 2020 meeting.

Mr Conlon noted he has a David Bevan interview on ABC Radio Adelaide on Friday 17 July, and another interview on 5AA with presenter Jade Robran at some stage next week. Mr Conlon will be able to use this as an opportunity to promote the resolutions made by Council at this meeting.

## RESOLUTION:

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Noted** the report provided by the Chair.

## 8.2 DEW Report

Ms Taylor thanked the support of Heritage SA in liaising with the CFS to organise mapping of the timber State Heritage Places in fire risk areas. It was noted that the CFS will support owners with undertaking a risk assessment of these places.

### **Economic Value of Heritage project**

Council discussed the report on the “Economic Value of Heritage to South Australia.” The following matters were raised in general discussion:

- Noted that with the impact of the bushfires and COVID-19 on the state economy, the Government will be primarily focussed on job creation and projects that stimulate economic growth.
- Important that the report has a clear Executive Summary and clear take home messages regarding the value of heritage to South Australia
- Agreed that it would be useful if the report included a comparative analysis with a similar sized industry to heritage in relation to jobs creation and dollar contribution to the SA economy.
- Further to the above, are the figures relating to heritage good, bad or indifferent?
- Noted that Heritage SA will seek feedback from Treasury staff regarding the content of the report.
- The report ought to be clear on the multiplier effect regarding the amount of private investment as a result of public investment.

Action: Council members to provide comment to Mrs Pope via email by Wednesday 22 July 2020, in order to help frame the nature of the request to the researchers.

### **Truth Telling**

Ms Voigt noted that Heritage South Australia will come back to Council with a proposal and process for consultation around truth telling of the Aboriginal story related to State Heritage Places. It was noted that there is limited work that can be done within existing resources within DEW.

Mr Conlon noted that a University of Adelaide based research project are working on a databank that compiles details of the story of conflict sites across South Australia, and this work is scheduled to be completed within twelve months. This databank will be a valuable source of information for the Council.

### **Monograph – Post World War 2 Places of Worship report**

Ms McDougall indicated that she will access hard copies of the monograph for each Council member via the University of Adelaide Architectural Museum.

## RESOLUTION

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Noted** the report provided by the Department for Environment and Water.

### 8.3 Correspondence

Noted.

## RESOLUTION

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Noted** the correspondence.

### 8.4 Delegations Report

Council noted the delegations report.

## RESOLUTION

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Noted**

## 9 ANY OTHER BUSINESS

### Truth telling re State Heritage listed monuments / statues

Council noted that across the globe there is an aroused movement of community support for removal or damage of historical statues that relate to slavery and subjugation of First Nation's people.

It was noted that this trend has been limited in South Australia to date, but there have been some recent cases of Light's statue being vandalised.

Council agreed there is an opportunity to be proactive around working with key stakeholders and recognise the impact that these statues and monuments represent in relation to Aboriginal culture.

There is an opportunity to provide a more inclusive 'story telling' associated with these monuments in a way that does not try to ignore or re-write history, but rather expand it, and recognise its impact.

It was noted that Heritage South Australia had circulated the document “Protecting Australia’s Commemorative Places and Monuments” to Council members prior to the meeting for information.

Council discussed the possibility of inserting a recognition / reconciliation statement in documents that relate to State Heritage Places – this would be a good first step.

Noted the LGA would be good to communicate with as they can disseminate the information appropriately to Local Council bodies.

It was noted that the Adelaide City Council has erected some good interpretative signage already – including some along the River Torrens. It was noted that the City of Adelaide has an Aboriginal Reconciliation Officer.

Council discussed the ownership of statues and monuments that are State Heritage listed and it was noted that it comes down to a case by case basis. In regards the City of Adelaide, the statues and monuments within the Park lands and city squares are within the care and control of the City of Adelaide.

Council discussed the idea of working with stakeholders to organise a supplementary plaque to the statue itself. As a first step, recognising the traditional lands that the statues reside on would be a good first step. As an example, an interpretive sign near the Colonel Light statue would indicate that it was on Kaurna land.

It was noted that there will be budget implications but the costs might be shared.

Reconciliation week is scheduled for May 2021 and it was noted that it would be appropriate to aim for some tangible actions to be completed by this date.

Action: The Chair / Executive Officer will consult with the City of Adelaide, the Local Government Association, Reconciliation SA and the History Trust of South Australia.

Action: The Chair to engage with the Minister for Environment and Water and the Minister for Aboriginal Affairs on this matter.

## **CLOSE OF MEETING**

Mr Conlon closed the meeting at 11:30am.



**Mr Keith Conlon OAM**

**Date:** 23 July 2020

**Chair**