

## SOUTH AUSTRALIAN HERITAGE COUNCIL

### MINUTES

The 112<sup>th</sup> Meeting of the South Australian Heritage Council (the Council) was held on Thursday 24 September 2020 via Electronic Means. (This meeting was held via video conference due to the isolation requirements of the COVID-19 pandemic).

#### Statement of Acknowledgement

*The Chairperson acknowledged that this land that the majority of Council members meet on today is the traditional lands for Kaurna people and that the Council respect their spiritual relationship with their country. The Chairperson also acknowledged the Kaurna people as the custodians of the Adelaide region and that their cultural and heritage beliefs are still as important to the living Kaurna people today. Mr David Stevenson noted he was participating in the video meeting via Burra and acknowledged the Ngadjuri people – the traditional owners of the Burra region and paid respect to their spiritual relationship with that country. Ms Jan Ferguson noted she was participating in the video meeting via Beltana and acknowledged the Adnyamathanha people – the traditional owners of Beltana region and paid respect to their spiritual relationship with that country.*

**Heritage Council:** Chair: Mr Keith Conlon OAM Members: Emeritus Professor Alison Mackinnon AM, Mr Marcus Rolfe, Ms Robyn Taylor, Mr Michael Constantine, Mr David Stevenson, Mr Jason Schulz and Ms Jan Ferguson OAM.

**Secretariat:** Mr David Hanna, Executive Officer, Heritage South Australia, Department for Environment and Water (DEW) and Ms Bev Voigt, Manager Heritage South Australia.

#### 1. WELCOME AND APOLOGIES

Mr Conlon welcomed all to the 112<sup>th</sup> meeting of the South Australian Heritage Council (the Council), noting there were several observers online.

Apologies: Ms Katrina McDougall and Ms Robyn Taylor.

#### 2. ADOPTION OF AGENDA AND DECLARATION OF CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

##### Agenda

The agenda was adopted without amendment.

##### Declarations of conflict of interest

Prior to the meeting, Ms Katrina McDougall had declared a conflict of interest in relation to Item 4.1 Dwelling – 28 Sturt Road, Brighton and therefore determined not to attend the meeting as this item is the only matter of business.

### 3 PREVIOUS MEETING MINUTES

Council considered the minutes of the 13 August 2020 meeting and approved them with no amendments.

#### RESOLUTION:

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Approved** the minutes of the 13 August 2020 meeting.

### 4. ITEMS UNDER CONSIDERATION FOR PROVISIONAL ENTRY IN THE SA HERITAGE REGISTER

#### 4.1 Dwelling – 28 Sturt Road, Brighton

Mr Conlon noted that a member of the public nominated the 'Dwelling' at 28 Sturt Road, Brighton for listing in the SA Heritage Register as a State Heritage Place.

The nominator suggested that the place meets criteria (a), (b), (f) and (g) of s16 of the *Heritage Places Act 1993* (the Act) for listing as a State Heritage Place.

The Council members were provided with the nomination along with a thorough assessment report prepared by Heritage South Australia. This assessment report considered the nomination against all criteria of section 16 of the *Heritage Places Act 1993*.

Mr Conlon welcomed Dr Louise Bird, Heritage South Australia to the meeting and invited her to make some opening remarks.

Dr Bird noted that on 19 August 2020 she undertook a site visit of the property, and a full Heritage Assessment was undertaken. The resulting report recommends that the nominated place does not meet any of the criteria for listing as a State Heritage Place.

Dr Bird noted the dwelling at 28 Sturt Road was commissioned by Charles Patrick Wauchope, designed by Louis Laybourne Smith in 1918, and constructed by Emmett & Son between 1918 and 1920. Charles and his family lived there between 1920-c.1931. The property was then lived in by a succession of people before it was purchased by Lance Le Cornu in 1959. No connection has been found to JGN Wauchope (who was company secretary for Adelaide Cement Company Ltd, Austral Cement) as claimed by the nominator.

In relation to Mr Charles Patrick Wauchope, he married into the Balfour bakery family in 1893 when he wed John and Elizabeth Balfour's daughter Margaret. Charles joined his mother-in-law's business E. Balfour Ltd where he assumed a managerial role and assisted her and Jack Balfour, his brother-in-law, to grow the bakery and café business. Charles would eventually become a director and then Chairman of Directors.

Dr Bird indicated that the dwelling at 28 Sturt Road has only a brief association with Charles Wauchope as he lived there for only a decade before relocating back to the Unley/Millswood area. It also does not demonstrate the important work that Charles was responsible for, namely, assisting Elizabeth Balfour and later the other company directors with the successful management and growth of the Balfour bakery and café business. It is the first café established by Elizabeth in 1894 in Rundle Street and modernised to a design by Laybourne Smith, and the Morphett Street bakery premises (expanded to a design by Laybourne Smith) that have a special association with the life and work of Charles Patrick Wauchope and Balfour's bakery.

Louis Laybourne Smith was the architect of this dwelling. It was noted that houses formed only a small fraction of Laybourne Smith's work, and between 1911 and 1930, he appears to have designed only 10 houses (new designs and substantial alterations). These include his own home (1911) and houses for two Balfour directors CH Wauchope (1918) and HN Hosking (1923). In 1918, Laybourne Smith designed two houses in the Federation bungalow style, the property for Charles Wauchope, 28 Sturt Rd, Brighton and 'Trefesa' for Mr GG Legoe.

Dr Bird indicated that the dwelling at 28 Sturt Road was the family home of Lance and Lloria Le Cornu for approximately 50 years. As Managing Director of Le Cornu he oversaw the expansion of the business interstate, the demolition of the much modified 1895 premises on O'Connell Street and the construction of the new shop in 1967, and the acquisition of the Chrysler assembly plant on ANZAC Highway, Keswick as the new Le Cornu factory/warehouse. In 2008, Le Cornu's was sold thus ending the Le Cornu family's association with the company.

Dr Bird indicated that the aspect with special importance to the history of South Australia is the organisation Le Cornu Ltd that was the furniture company, and not the person Lance Le Cornu. While the property at 28 Sturt Rd was Lance Le Cornu's home, it does not demonstrate the work of the Le Cornu furniture company, nor does it have a special association with Le Cornu Ltd. Unfortunately, any of the places that might demonstrate that association have been demolished, including the various shops on O'Connell Street, the North Adelaide factory, and the Keswick factory and warehouse.

It was noted that the place had been recommended for Local Heritage listing, though it was never listed as such.

Council heard that Louis Laybourne Smith's own house, and also 'Trefesa', a house designed for Mr GG Legoe, are better examples of this architect's work in this particular style.

Mr Conlon worked through each of the criteria that this place was nominated against – criteria (a), (b), (f) and (g).

In relation to criterion (a) *'It demonstrates important aspects of the evolution or pattern of the State's history'*, Council agreed it did not meet this criterion, noting it agreed with the assessment in relation to the relationship between the first owner, Mr Wauchope, and the subsequent owner, Mr Le Cornu, and the dwelling.

In relation to criterion (b) *'It has rare, uncommon or endangered qualities that are of cultural significance'*, Council agreed it did not meet this criterion, noting it agreed with the assessment that the place is one of a number of Federation bungalows built in SA during the interwar period, and one of many houses designed by architectural firm Woods, Bagot, Jory and Laybourne Smith.

In relation to criterion (f) *'It has strong cultural or spiritual association for the community or a group within it'*, Council agreed it did not meet this criterion. Council talked about the recent upswell of support to protect this place in the area around Brighton. It was noted the association has been demonstrated only recently and is mainly local, even though social media is now being used to promote the cause far beyond the Brighton area.

In relation to criterion (g), *'It has a special association with the life or work of a person or organisation or an event of historical importance'*, Council agreed it did not meet this criterion, noting it agreed with Dr Bird's assessment in relation to associations with CP Wauchope, architect Louis Laybourne Smith and Lance and Llorra Le Cornu of Le Cornu Ltd.

It was noted that Council agreed with the assessment report that concluded the place did not meet any of the other criteria, being (c), (d) and (e), under section 16 of the *Heritage Places Act 1993*.

Council was unanimous in its agreement with the recommendation put forward by Heritage South Australia and rejected the nomination.

Mr Conlon made closing observations for the benefit of the observers of the meeting. He noted that the Council can only provisionally enter a place if it meets one or more of the criteria under section 16 of the *Heritage Places Act 1993*. The guidelines for listing set a high bar for each criterion.

Mr Conlon pointed out that three places slated for demolition or sub division have been presented to Council recently. It is difficult for the Council and Heritage South Australia, working with limited resources, to process nominations that come in at the eleventh hour. It takes time to do a comprehensive assessment of a place, and therefore people are encouraged to get their nominations in early and in a proactive manner.

Mr Conlon commented on the need for reform regarding assessment of local and state heritage. The Council has advocated consistently for an integrated system with clear and benchmarked criteria, which would allow for a simple and transparent procedure for listing Local Heritage Places and State Heritage Places. Council has made submissions in this regard to the Environment, Resources and Development Committee of Parliament, our Minister, the SA Planning Commission, and most recently to the Legislative Review Committee of Parliament.

Mr Conlon put out a plea to communities to look at the places they value in their area. Are they protected through some form of heritage listing? Do they warrant protection through Local Heritage or State Heritage listing? If they think they might be of heritage value, Mr Conlon asked for communities to please consider being proactive and nominate them to the relevant body before the bulldozers begin to move in.

Mr Rolfe endorsed the comments of Mr Conlon, and re iterated that the Council can only list a place if it meets one or more of the specific criteria set out in our legislation.

## RESOLUTION

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **REJECTED** the nomination of Dwelling, 28 Sturt Road, Brighton for entry in the South Australian Heritage Register as a State Heritage Place, as it does not meet any of the criteria for State heritage listing under section 16 of the *Heritage Places Act 1993*.

## 5 IN MEMORIAM

### 5.1 Vale Syd Sparrow

Mr Keith Conlon noted with sorrow the passing of Mr Sydney Sparrow. Mr Sparrow passed away on 12 September 2020.

Syd was the Chair of the State Aboriginal Heritage Committee and will be sorely missed not only by his committee members, but also the Ngarrindjeri people and the state of South Australia.

Sydney Sparrow was a Ngarrindjeri man with extensive knowledge of Aboriginal heritage and deep experience in advocating for its protection and preservation.

He oversaw important amendments to the Aboriginal Heritage Act and he was an outstanding advocate for Aboriginal youth justice.

Mr Conlon noted with sadness that the Council was about to embark on some work with Mr Sparrow through a joint working group of the two Councils.

Council agreed to write to the State Aboriginal Heritage Committee, and to also write directly to Mr Sparrow's family to express its condolences at Mr Sparrow's passing.

## RESOLUTION

The South Australian Heritage Council:

- **Resolved** to write to Mr Syd Sparrow's family and to the State Aboriginal Heritage Committee to pass on its condolences at the passing of Mr Syd Sparrow.

## 6. ANY OTHER BUSINESS

Nil

## CLOSE OF MEETING

Mr Conlon closed the meeting at 9:40am



**Mr Keith Conlon OAM**

**Date:** 22 October 2020

**Chair**